

1. ORIGINAL PROCEDURE FOR CHOOSING λ

To quote from Storey and Taylor 2004, the bootstrap procedure for choosing λ is:

- Step 1: for some range of λ , say $\mathcal{R} = \{0, 0.05, 0.10, \dots, 0.95\}$, calculate $\hat{\pi}_0(\lambda)$ as in Section 2.
- Step 2: for each $\lambda \in \mathcal{R}$, form B bootstrap versions $\pi_0^{*b}(\lambda)$ of the estimate, $b = 1, \dots, B$, by taking bootstrap samples of the p-values.
- Step 3: for each $\lambda \in \mathcal{R}$, estimate its respective MSE as

$$\widehat{\text{MSE}}(\lambda) = \frac{1}{B} \sum_{b=1}^B [\pi_0^{*b}(\lambda) - \min_{\lambda' \in \mathcal{R}} \{\hat{\pi}_0(\lambda')\}]$$

- Step 4: set $\hat{\lambda} = \operatorname{argmin}_{\lambda \in \mathcal{R}} \{\widehat{\text{MSE}}(\lambda)\}$

2. DISTRIBUTION OF BOOTSTRAP ESTIMATOR

As defined in Table 1 of Storey 2004, let $W(\lambda) = \sum_{i=1}^m I\{p_i > \lambda\}$, the number of p-values greater than λ . This means that (as described in Storey 2004 Eq 4):

$$\hat{\pi}_0(\lambda) = \frac{W(\lambda)}{m(1-\lambda)}$$

Let $q_{1 \dots m}^{*b}$ be the resampled p-values in bootstrap sample b (as done in Step 2 above), and let $W^{*b}(\lambda)$ be this value calculated for bootstrap sample b .

$$W^{*b}(\lambda) = \sum_{i=1}^m I_{q_i > \lambda}$$

Since there are $W(\lambda)$ p-values greater than λ out of a set of m , this means

$$P(q_i^{*b} > \lambda) = \frac{W(\lambda)}{m}$$

and therefore, since the sum of iid Bernoulli variables is binomial:

$$W^{*b}(\lambda) \sim \text{Binom}(m, \frac{W(\lambda)}{m})$$

which means

$$\begin{aligned} E[W^{*b}(\lambda)] &= W(\lambda) \\ \text{Var}[W^{*b}(\lambda)] &= m \frac{W(\lambda)}{m} (1 - \frac{W(\lambda)}{m}) = W(\lambda) (1 - \frac{W(\lambda)}{m}) \\ E[\pi_0^{*b}(\lambda)] &= \frac{W(\lambda)}{m(1-\lambda)} \\ \text{Var}[\pi_0^{*b}(\lambda)] &= \frac{1}{m^2(1-\lambda)^2} \text{Var}[W^{*b}(\lambda)] = \frac{W(\lambda)}{m^2(1-\lambda)^2} (1 - \frac{W(\lambda)}{m}) \end{aligned}$$

This is a closed form solution for the distribution of $\pi_0^{*b}(\lambda)$ in terms of $W(\lambda)$ and m , which means we can remove the need for bootstrap estimation. Specifically,

$$\begin{aligned} \lim_{b \rightarrow \infty} \widehat{\text{MSE}}(\lambda) &= \text{Var}[\pi_0^{*b}(\lambda)] + (E[\pi_0^{*b}(\lambda)] - \min_{\lambda' \in \mathcal{R}} \{\hat{\pi}_0(\lambda')\})^2 \\ &= \frac{W(\lambda)}{m^2(1-\lambda)^2} (1 - \frac{W(\lambda)}{m}) + (\hat{\pi}_0(\lambda) - \min_{\lambda' \in \mathcal{R}} \{\hat{\pi}_0(\lambda')\})^2 \end{aligned}$$

3. NEW PROCEDURE

- Step 1: for some range of λ , say $\mathcal{R} = \{0, 0.05, 0.10, \dots, 0.95\}$, calculate $\hat{\pi}_0(\lambda)$ as in Section 2, and $W(\lambda)$ as above.
- Step 2: for each $\lambda \in \mathcal{R}$, estimate its respective MSE as

$$\widehat{\text{MSE}}(\lambda) = \frac{W(\lambda)}{m^2(1-\lambda)^2} (1 - \frac{W(\lambda)}{m}) + (\hat{\pi}_0(\lambda) - \min_{\lambda' \in \mathcal{R}} \{\hat{\pi}_0(\lambda')\})^2$$

- Step 3: set $\hat{\lambda} = \operatorname{argmin}_{\lambda \in \mathcal{R}} \{\widehat{\text{MSE}}(\lambda)\}$